Town of Fort Erie    Community & Development Services

Our Focus: Your Future

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Prepared for</th>
<th>Council-in-Committee</th>
<th>Report No.</th>
<th>CDS-082-1-07</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Agenda Date</td>
<td>October 1, 2007</td>
<td>File No.</td>
<td>350201</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Subject

AWARD OF ARCHITECTURAL SERVICES
REHABILITATION OF THE LOBSTER HOUSE & SITE PLAN FOR BAY BEACH

Summary of Recommendation

THAT the firm of Architectural Resources of Buffalo, New York, in partnership with JP Design (Jason Pizzicarola) of Ridgeway, Ontario be retained to provide the Corporation of the Town of Fort Erie with architectural consulting services for the rehabilitation of the Lobster House in the amount of $48,300, plus GST, and;

THAT Council postpones commencing the contract until after it has had an opportunity to review the initial draft of the 2008-2011 Capital Plan.

Alternatives:

THAT Council allocate funds from the Major Capital Reserve to complete the architectural design and code drawings for the redevelopment of the Lobster House building as per the scope of work specified in Phase 1A of RFP CDS-07-2007, and further;

THAT Council award Phase 1C of RFP CDS-07-2007, being the Site Plan for Bay Beach to Architectural Resources, in the amount of $24,150, plus GST with the funds being allocated from the Parkland Reserve, and further;

THAT Staff be authorized to prepare the necessary By-law authorizing the Mayor and Clerk to execute the Agreement for architectural consulting services on behalf of the Town of Fort Erie.

Relation to Council’s 2007-2010 Corporate Strategic Plan

Priority: Development and Land Use
Goal: Increase Waterfront Accessibility and Parkland
Initiative: Develop a Site Plan for Bay Beach
### List of Stakeholders

- Crystal Beach Improvement Area, Friends of Crystal Beach
- Property owners within the Bay Beach and Crystal Beach area
- All Fort Erie ratepayers and visitors

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Prepared by:</th>
<th>Submitted by:</th>
<th>Approved by:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Original signed</td>
<td>Original signed</td>
<td>Original signed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tom Villella, MCIP, RPP</td>
<td>R. Mostacci, MCIP, RPP</td>
<td>Harry Schlange, MBA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neighbourhood Planner</td>
<td>Director, Community &amp;</td>
<td>Chief Administrative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Development Services</td>
<td>Officer</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Purpose of Report

To advise Council on the results of the proposal call process for the Request for Architectural Services for the Refurbishment of the Lobster House and a Site Plan for Bay Beach, and to request Council to authorize the award of the project to the firm of Architectural Resources in partnership with JP Design.

At the Council-in-Committee meeting of September 4, 2007 the following recommendation was tabled to allow staff to obtain further information respecting a potential conflict of interest between a partner of the firm and an adjacent property owner.

THAT: This matter be tabled to the next Community and Development Services, Council-in-Committee meeting of October 1, 2007.

A memo of explanation has been provided under separate cover.

Analysis

By way of Report CDS-045-07, on June 11, 2007, Council authorized Staff to proceed with a Request for Proposals for architectural services related to the refurbishment of the Lobster House and the preparation of a Site Plan for Bay Beach.

Council will recall that after the Town acquired Bay Beach, a number of buildings on-site were removed to provide for additional open space and development opportunities. The building known as “The Lobster House” was retained due to its potential for re-use as a facility to enhance the beach experience. The building is considered architecturally interesting, although it is not designated as an historic structure at this time.

Staff reported to Council on this issue in October 2006, subsequent to an “Expression of Interest” initiated by the Town and EDTC. Staff was directed by Council to retain the services of an architect to undertake a preliminary building assessment of the Lobster House and prepare recommendations for the balance of the lands, in consideration of Council’s Strategic Plan objectives for the property. The Building Assessment Report was prepared by Raimondo + Associates and presented to Council in June 2007. The report estimates that the cost for improvements to the building to bring it to a “finished shell” state is expected to be in the range of $187,000 to $225,000. Council then directed Staff to proceed with the RFP for the preparation of architectural design and code drawings for the Lobster House, as well as preparation of the site plan for Bay Beach.

Proposal Call Results
Request for Proposal CDS-07-2007 was advertised in the Niagara Falls Review on July 25, 2007, and in the Fort Erie Times on July 28, 2007. The RFP was also advertised on the Ontario Association of Architects website, the Niagara Society of Architects website, and the Town of Fort Erie website beginning July 25, 2007. A total of 32 packages were distributed to architectural firms from not only the Niagara Peninsula, but from the Greater Toronto Area and Western New York.

Staff hosted a pre-submission meeting at the Bay Beach site on Wednesday, August 8, 2007. Ten persons attended the site meeting and toured the Bay Beach property including the interior of the Lobster House. The deadline for RFP submissions was 2:00 pm on Friday, August 17, 2007. Five (5) proposals were submitted on or before the deadline. One proposal was received at 2:10 pm on the closing date, and was returned unopened to the proponent, as per municipal policy.

A proposal review and evaluation process was undertaken for the selection of the successful proponent. A Proposal Evaluation Committee was formed, which consisted of members from the Community and Development Services and Infrastructure Services Departments. The proposals were evaluated based upon the criteria outlined in the RFP and the Town’s Purchasing Policy, which considers the consultant team’s qualifications and expertise, completeness and creativity of the proposal, project team, project schedule, knowledge of the Town regarding the project, and proposed fees and disbursements.

The following table summarizes the result of the evaluation process:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Proposals received before August 17, 2007 at 2:00 pm for Architectural Consulting Services in response to CDS-07-2007</th>
<th>Overall Proposal Score (Phase 1A) and Estimated Fee Maximum Score - 1000</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>COLUMN 1</td>
<td>COLUMN 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Architectural Resources</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ranked #1 prior to fees</td>
<td>673</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Raimondo + Associates</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ranked #2 prior to fees</td>
<td>636</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Quartek Group Inc</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ranked #4 prior to fees</td>
<td>532</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Lapointe Architects</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ranked #3 prior to fees</td>
<td>534</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>MacDonald Zuberec Ensslen</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ranked #5 prior to fees</td>
<td>486</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Should Council wish to review the proposal submissions in detail, each of the proposal submissions can be made available in the Community and Development Services.

The firm of Architectural Resources of Buffalo, New York (in partnership with JP Design of Ridgeway, Ontario) was ranked No.1 overall. The firm was also ranked No. 1 prior to the fees being disclosed. Architectural Resources’ proposal is considered thorough and technically sound, and the fee structure is arithmetically correct.

Architectural Resources has completed a number of municipal projects in Western New York and the Metro New York City area, including the design of the Gateway Point Waterfront Park in North Tonawanda, NY (urban design project for the area surrounding the terminus of the Erie Canal at the Niagara River), the Roycroft Inn in East Aurora, NY (rehabilitation and commercial re-use of an historic structure and site), and a new Public Library for Ellicottville, NY. Staff has conducted reference checks and the firm was highly recommended. As previously noted, Architectural Resources will be partnering with JP Design of Ridgeway, Ontario, a local architectural firm with experience working in the Fort Erie area, and with various agencies that will be involved in this project, most notably the Niagara Peninsula Conservation Authority.

The Evaluation Committee unanimously recommends that the proposal submitted by Architectural Resources/JP Design in the amount of $48,300 be accepted and the project be awarded to this consultant. It is anticipated that the work program for this project will commence immediately and be completed in approximately two to three months.

**Provisional Items**

Two provisional items were included in the RFP, being the Contract Administration and the Design of the Site Plan for Bay Beach. All proponents were requested to bid on the provisional items as well, and were made aware that these items were unbudgeted and unscheduled at this time. Architectural Resources remained the No.1 ranked firm when factoring in the provisional items (total score of 692), with Raimondo + Associates coming in second (total score of 636).

If Council were so inclined, the Site Plan for Bay Beach (Provisional Item 1C) could be incorporated into this project at this time at an additional cost of $24,150. Staff has previously indicated that it would be preferable from an overall planning perspective to prepare the site plan for the entire Bay Beach property at the same time as design of the Lobster House, since the refurbishment of the building should be considered in the context of the overall vision for Bay Beach. Later this month, Council will be presented with the findings of the Crystal Beach Parking Study, which will provide recommendations for future parking in the vicinity of Bay Beach. Therefore, the timing of the two projects allows for an integrated approach to resolving the questions surrounding the final disposition of the Bay Beach lands.

Contract Administration (Provisional Item 1B) would not be considered until such time as Council authorizes the construction of the Lobster House Refurbishment. Staff would report to Council on this item through the 2008 Budget deliberations.
Financial/Staffing Implications

Since no financial resources were allocated to this project in its 2007 budget, Council ought to consider postponing commencement of the contract until after it has had an opportunity to review the initial draft of the 2008-2011 Capital Plan.

Alternatively, Council may proceed at this time by funding phase 1A of the project from the Major Capital Reserve (approx. $50,000).

Also, if Council chooses to proceed with the Site Plan for Bay Beach (Provisional Item 1C), this can be funded from the Parkland Reserve (approx. $25,000).

The Neighbourhood Planner will manage the project with support from the Chief Building Official and Infrastructure Services Staff.

Comments from Relevant Departments/Community & Corporate Partners

Community input into this initiative has been ongoing since 2001, through the Bay Beach Design Charette and the development of the Crystal Beach Neighbourhood Plan. The RFP was circulated to all Town Departments and the EDTC for comment/input. The Proponent has included a charette process in their proposal, in order to involve the community in the design of the building and site.

Alternatives

Council could choose to proceed with:

- Phase 1A only (Lobster House design and code drawings) at a cost of $48,300
- Phase 1A and 1C together (Lobster House and Bay Beach Site Plan design) at a total cost of $72,450

\[
\begin{align*}
&\$48,300 \text{ for Phase 1A} \\
&\$24,150 \text{ for Phase 1C} \\
&\$72,450 \text{ total}
\end{align*}
\]

Conclusion
Fully realizing the vision for Bay Beach as expressed through the Crystal Beach Neighbourhood Plan and Council’s stated direction is an objective that requires significant investment. Although actual development of the property may be implemented incrementally over time, it is important to have an “end state” site plan to work towards, and proper architectural design and code drawings for the Lobster House. Having these key items in place will support future public/private investment in the site. Council has recognized this through the inclusion of Bay Beach in its Corporate Strategic Plan.

**Attachments**

Appendix 1 – Location Plan